RECAP
CLARIFICATION
Implementation strategies for health systems in low-income countries: an overview of systematic reviews

Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews

Tomas Pantoja, Newton Opiyo, Agustín Ciapponi, Lilian Dudley, Marie-Pierre Gagnon, Cristian A Herrera, Simon Lewin, Sebastian García Martí, Andrew D Oxman, Elizabeth Paulsen, Blanca Peñaloza, Gabriel Rada, Jimmy Volmink, Charles Shey Wiysonge

First published: 5 May 2014

Editorial Group: Cochrane Effective Practice and Organisation of Care Group

DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD011086  View/save citation

Cited by (CrossRef): 0 articles  Check for updates
Theories models and frameworks

Implementation science workshop
Hawassa University, August 21-25, 2017

E-mail: anna.bergstrom@kbh.uu.se
Today

- THE RATIONAL FOR USING THEORIES/FRAMEWORKS/MODELS
- A FEW EXAMPLES
THE RATIONAL FOR USING THEORIES, FRAMEWORKS AND MODELS
Using or not using theory

- An expensive versions of trial and error, providing little or no knowledge about which factors successfully influenced implementation efforts.

  *Eccles et al., 2005*

- Transferring theory to the design of studies is not straightforward and there are many theories and it is not clear which ones should be given primacy.

  *Bhattacharyya et al., 2006*

Whether one uses theory or not, one needs to identify

- **how** an innovation and the implementation strategy produces certain outcomes,
- **explore** by which processes change is brought about, and
- **define** which contextual factors that are critical for success or failure.
Why we do this

- Helps practitioners **plan implementation and think ahead**
- Guides researchers to **decide which data to gather to describe and explain implementation**
- May include hypotheses or theory about **action steps needed and critical contextual influences**
Theories, frameworks and models

A theory is “a coherent and non-contradictory set of statements, concepts or ideas that organizes, predicts and explains phenomena, events, behaviour, etc.”

Bem S and Looren-de-Jong H, 1997

Models are specific and attempts to objectify the concept they represent – has value even if not complete

Frankfort-Nachmias et al, 1996

A framework provides a frame of reference, assists in organizing thinking and guides the user on what to focus on.

Rycroft-Malone and Bucknall, 2010
Types of theories, models and frameworks in Imp Sci

Table 1. Definitions of categories used to sort models

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Variable definition</th>
<th>Anchor definitions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construct flexibility</td>
<td>Definition/flexibility of model constructs</td>
<td>1 = Broad: loosely outlined and defined constructs; allows researchers greater flexibility to apply the model to a wide array of D&amp;I activities and contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 = Operational: detailed, step-by-step actions for completion of D&amp;I research processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissemination and/or implementation (D/I)</td>
<td>Focus on dissemination and/or implementation activities</td>
<td>D-only: Focus on active approach of spreading evidence-based interventions to the target audience via determined channels using planned strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D = I: Equal focus on dissemination and implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I-only: Focus on process of putting to use or integrating evidence-based interventions within a setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socioecologic framework</td>
<td>Level of the framework at which the model operates</td>
<td>Individual: Personal characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Organization: Hospitals, service organizations, factory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Community: Local government, neighborhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>System: Hospital system, government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Categorization of D&I models for use in research studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Dissemination and/or implementation</th>
<th>Construct flexibility: broad to operational</th>
<th>Socioecologic Level</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diffusion of Innovation</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>System</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAND Model of Persuasive</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication and Diffusion of Medical Innovation</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective Dissemination Strategies</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model for Locally Based Research Transfer Development</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams of Policy Process</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>25, 26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tabak, 2012
Types of theories, models and frameworks in Imp Sci cont.

- Theoretical approaches used in implementation science
  - Describing and/or guiding the process of translating research into practice
    - Process models
  - Understanding and/or explaining what influences implementation outcomes
  - Evaluating implementation

Nilsen, 2015
A FEW EXAMPLES
Some examples

- Theory of diffusion - Classic (determinant)
- Theory of planned behavior - Classic (determinant)
- Promoting Action on Research Implementation in Health Services framework – Determinant
- Integrated-Promoting Action on Research Implementation in Health Services framework – Determinant (but some process)
THE GODFATHER

a classic theory/determinant –
more towards passive spread
Mr. Rogers

- This theory seeks to explain how innovations are taken up in a population.
- An innovation is an idea, behavior, or object that is perceived as new by its audience.
- Diffusion is the process in which the innovation is communicated through certain channels over time among members of a social system.
What qualities make an innovation spread successfully?

1. Relative advantage
2. Compatibility with existing values and practices
3. Simplicity and ease of use
4. Trialability
5. Observable results

(1-5) determine 49-87% of variation
Social system: Adopter categories
The effect of time

- Knowledge
- Persuasion
- Decision
- Implementation
- Confirmation

Prior conditions

Time

- Adoption
  - Continued adoption
  - Later adoption
- Rejection
  - Discontinuance
  - Continued rejection
Theory planned behavior (TPB) – classic theory/determinant

Affective attitude
Instrumental attitude

Behavioral attitude

Injunctive norm
Descriptive norm

Subjective norms

Perceived behavioral control

Intention

Behavior

Ajzen, 1991
Promoting Action on Research Implementation in Health Services (PARIHS) determinant

- Evidence
  - Research evidence
  - Clinical experience
  - Locally derived data
  - Patient preferences

- Context
  - Leadership
  - Evaluation
  - Organizational culture

- Facilitation
  - ‘technique by which one person makes things easier for others’

Rycroft-Malone et al., 2002
Look at the slides from yesterday presenting the characteristics of these constructs!

*Harvey and Kitson, 2015*
Consolidated Framework for Implementation Research (CFIR)

The CFIR provides a menu of constructs that can serve

- As a practical guide for systematically assessing potential barriers and facilitators (preparation for implementing an innovation,

- To provide theory-based constructs for developing context-specific logic models

Constructs

- Intervention characteristics
  - Setting

Damschroder et al. 2009
http://cfirguide.org/
CFIR cont.

The constructs can be used as implementation and evaluation criteria in three different ways, they may:

- Raise awareness for potential influential factors
- Facilitate the analysis of key processes and outcomes
- Help organise all findings of an implementation process to explain the outcomes

http://cfirguide.org/
CHOOSING YOUR THEORY, MODEL OR FRAMEWORK
Choosing theory (framework or model)

Determine the origin. Who developed it? Where are they from (institution, discipline)? What prompted the originator to develop it? Is there evidence to support or refute the development of the theory?

Examine the meaning. What are the concepts and how they relate to each other. What are the concepts comprising the theory? How are the concepts defined? What is the relationship between concepts?

Analyze the logical consistency. Is there a logical structure of the concepts and statements? Are there any logical fallacies in the structure of the theory?

Consider the degree of generalisability and parsimony of the theory. Can generalizations can be made from the theory? How simple and briefly can the theory be stated and still be complete in its explanation of the phenomenon?

Determine the testability. Can the theory be supported with empirical data? A theory that cannot generate hypotheses that can be subjected to empirical testing through research is not testable.

Determine the usefulness of the theory. Usefulness of the theory is about how practical and helpful the theory is in providing a sense of understanding and/or predictable outcomes.

ICEBeRG and Rycroft-Malone, 2007
- Type of theory/model framework
  - Classic change theory/Process model/determinant framework
- What evidence is there to support the assumptions made?
- Can it guide you planning?
- Can it guide your tailoring?
- Can it guide you to choosing your implementation strategy?
- Can it guide the evaluation?
Assignment (only a few examples!)

- Would the use of a framework assist you in informing and planning for evaluating a component of the OHEP intervention?
- Would the use of a framework be of value for your PhD for:
  - Generating in-depth understanding of determinants for change?
  - Better describe change processes?
  - Understand variations in outcomes?
  - Understand how characteristics of the innovation, recipients or context influenced the outcome?
- Could your study provide evidence or understanding of the validity of a framework in a low-income setting?